

# Judicial Independence Essay

## 2006 Arizona Law Day Essay Contest



Due \_\_\_\_\_

100 pts. Possible - One week redo - Should be submitted on-line.

MUST BE TYPED

***EQ:*** (answer one or both)

- *Why fair and impartial courts are important to maintain the rule of law?*
- *How does Arizona's history and constitution reflect an approach to judicial independence?*

**Suggested Connections** (Rule of law and one more required, three or more for a 90%+)

Judicial independence	Judicial review	Rule of law
Separation of powers	Federalist #78	President Taft's Veto of Arizona Statehood
President Taft's disagreement with Teddy Roosevelt's call for popular approval of Supreme Court Decisions	Why don't supreme court justices clap at the State of the Union speech	Santa Cruz County elects judges by popular vote
Recall of judges (Taft) and AZ Constitution	Article III – U.S. Constitution	Article VI – AZ Constitution

## Outline

- I. Intro
  - a. Hook
  - b. Background
  - c. Restate and answer EQ
- II. How Judicial Indolence is created in Art. II of the US Constitution
- III. How Judicial Indolence is created in Article VI of AZ
- IV. How the Arizona Constitution lessens judicial independence
- V. Taft
  - a. Veto of AZ Statehood
  - b. Teddy Roosevelt's plan in 1912 presidential campaign for popular approval of U.S. Supreme Court decisions
- VI. What judicial independence means for the rule of law (connection 1)
- VII. Connection 2
- VIII. Connection 3
- IX. Conclusion and personal connection

## Sources

- [Taft's Veto Message of Arizona's Constitution](#)
- [WILLIAM HOWARD TAFT "Preserving the Balance" 1909-1913](#)
- [Brennan Center Bibliography on Judicial Independence](#)
- [Fighting for Fair, Impartial Courts](#), by Helen Perry Grimwood, *Arizona Attorney*, February 2006
- [Fair Courts Under Fire](#), *Arizona Attorney*, February 2006
- [Politics Threatens Arizona's Judiciary](#), By Dev Sethi, Kinerk, Beal, Schmidt, Dyer & Sethi, P.C.
- [About the US Courts](#)
- [2006 American Bar Association Law Day](#)
- [2005 Constitution Day Resources \(American Bar Association\)](#)
- [American Bar Association Report on Judicial Independence](#)
- [American Bar Association Commission on Civic Education and Judicial Independence](#)
- [State Bar of Arizona's Stand up for Fair Courts](#)

**Grading**

1. \_\_\_\_\_ Mentions the concept of the three branches of government
2. \_\_\_\_\_ Mentions the role of the judicial system in the three branches
3. \_\_\_\_\_ Defines the ‘rule of law’
4. \_\_\_\_\_ Connects rule of law to judicial independence
5. \_\_\_\_\_ Defines judicial independence
6. \_\_\_\_\_ Quotes William Howard Taft
7. \_\_\_\_\_ Quotes Taft’s Veto Message of Arizona Statehood
8. \_\_\_\_\_ Cites AZ Constitution
9. \_\_\_\_\_ Cites U.S. Constitution
10. \_\_\_\_\_ Mentions how recall and election of judges do NOT promote judicial independence
11. \_\_\_\_\_ Personal connection
12. \_\_\_\_\_ Takes a clear position in thesis
13. \_\_\_\_\_ Thesis answers the essential question
14. \_\_\_\_\_ Thesis supported / paragraphs follow thesis
15. \_\_\_\_\_ Clearly uses "habits of mind."
16. \_\_\_\_\_ Written in third person
17. \_\_\_\_\_ States the significance of the issue
18. \_\_\_\_\_ Makes connections between the EQ and another topic
19. \_\_\_\_\_ Follows assignment outline.
20. \_\_\_\_\_ At least two quotes and or opinion incorporated in essays evidence.
21. \_\_\_\_\_ Makes a sandwich of the quotes
22. \_\_\_\_\_ Thesis restated in conclusion?
23. \_\_\_\_\_ Problem or issue addressed, analyzed, evaluated or solved?
24. \_\_\_\_\_ Incorporates and connects constitutional, historical and/or economic principles or sources.
25. \_\_\_\_\_ States another point of such as the other side of the writer’s thesis.
26. \_\_\_\_\_ Works cited page.

Six-Traits Writing – 1 to 5 possible in each = 20X 5 = 100 possible

Ideas	Organization	Fluency	Conventions	Total	X5=

We invite all Arizona 10-12 graders to enter the 2006 Arizona Law Day Essay Contest. Three winners will be chosen from each [County](#) in Arizona, and will receive a special recognition plaque - with the First Place essay in each County receiving a \$150 gift card and a trip to a special recognition event in May at the [Arizona Supreme Court](#) where the First Place winners and their family and teachers will meet Arizona Supreme Court justices and talk with them about the importance of fair and impartial courts..

Essays may not be more than 1,000 words, and must be received by **March 15, 2006**

- [Introduction by Arizona Supreme Court Chief Justice Ruth V. McGregor](#)
- [2006 Law Day Essay Timeline](#)
- [2006 Law Day Essay Judging Criteria Rubric](#)
- [Supreme Court of Arizona](#)